## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Ahmadian, M. \& Hosseini, S. 2012. A study on the relationship between Iranian EFL learners' multiple intelligences and their performance on writing. Mediterranean Journal of Social Science, 3 (1), 111-126.
Armstrong, Thomas. 2009. Multiple intelligences in the classroom. (Third ed.). Alexandria: ASCD Publication.
Armstrong, Thomas. 2012. Multiple intelligences. Retrieved from http://www.institute4learning.com/multiple intelligences.php. accessed on : November 12th 2012.

Bas G. \& Beyhan O. 2010. Effects of multiple intelligences supported projectbased learning on students' achievement levels and attitudes toward English lesson. International Electronic Journal of Elementary Education, 2 (3), 365-386.

Bas. G. 2008. Integrating multiple intelligences in EFL/ESL classrooms. The Internet TESL Journal, 14 (5).

Becker, K. A. 2003. History of the Stanford-Binet intelligence scales: Content and psychometrics. (Stanford-Binet Intelligence Scales, Fifth Edition Assessment Service Bulletin No. 1). Itasca, IL: Riverside Publishing.

Blanchard, K. \& Root, C. 1998. Get ready to write: A beginning writing text. New York: Pearson Education.

Brown, H. D. 2007. Principles of language learning and teaching. (Fifth Ed.). New York: Pearson Education.

Christison A. M. 1995. Multiple intelligences and second language learners. The Journal of Imagination in Language Learning and Teaching, 3.
(Retrieved from : http://www.njcu.edu/cill/vol3/christison.html, accessed on November, $12^{\text {th }}, 2012$.

Christison A. M. 1996. Applying multiple intelligences theory in the foreign language classroom. MEXTESOL Journal, 19 (3), 27-43.

Davies, S. 2003. Content-based instruction in EFL context. The Internet TESL Journal, 9 (2).

Derewianka, B. 1992. Exploring how texts work. Australia: Primary English Teaching Association.

Dornyei, Z. 2001. Motivational Strategies in the Language Classroom. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Farrel, S. C. T. \& Jacobs M. G. 2010. Essential for successful English language teaching. New York: Continuum International Publishing Group.

Fose, L. 2006 Exploring technology to address multiple intelligences \& learning styles. ITS technology and learning services. Retrieved fromhttp://www.calpoly.edu/~lfose/articles/Exploring Technology.pdf, accessed on November, 13, 2012.

Gardner, Howard. 1993. Introduction to the tenth anniversary edition of Frames of Mind. Cambridge: Massachusetts.

Gardner, Howard. 2003. Multiple intelligences after twenty years. Paper presented at the American Educational Research Association, Chicago, Illinois, April 21, 2003.

Gardner, Howard. 2011. Frames of Mind: the theory Multiple intelligences. (Third Ed.). New York: Basic Book.

Gay, L. R, Mills, G. E \& Airasian, P. 2006. Educational research: Competencies for analysis and application. (Eighth Ed.). USA: Pearson Merrill Prentice Hall.

Gimson, C. A. 1980. An introduction to the pronunciation of English. Hongkong: Wing King Tong Co. Itd.

Graham, M., Milanowski, A., \& Miller. J. 2012. Measuring and promoting interrater agreement of teacher and principal performance ratings. CECR: Center for Educator Compensation Reform.

Harmer, J. 2004. The practice of English language teaching. (Fourth Ed.). Harlow: Longman

Jacobs, H. L, S. A. Zingraf, D. R. Wormuth, V. F. Hartfield, and J. B Hughey. 1981.Testing ESL composition: a practical Approach. Rowley, Mass: Newbury House. pg. 104-105. (as cited in) Hughes, Arthur. 2003. Testing for language teachers. (Second Ed.). New York: Cambridge University Press.

Kellogg, R. T \& Raulerson B. A. 2002. Improving the writing skill of college students. Psychonomic Bulletin \& Review. Production Number RCE709./

Larsen-Freeman, D. 2000. Techniques and principles in language teaching. (Second Ed.). UK: Oxford University Press.

Leo. S., Groth, C., Yugianingrum, Sudiarto, H., Oktaviani. 2007. English for academic purposes: Essay writing. Yogyakarta: CV. Andi Offset.

Lica, Gabriela Mihaila. 2003. Suggestopedia: A wonder approach to learning foreign languages. Retrieved from http://www.actrus.ro/biblioteca/anuare/2003/SUGGESTOPEDIA.pdf, accessed on December 2 ${ }^{\text {nd }}, 2012$.

Mackey, A. \& Gass, S. M. 2005. Second language research, methodology and design. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

McKay, L. S. 2006. Researching second language classroom. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

McKenzie, W. 1999. Multiple Intelligences Inventory. Retrieved at (http://surfaquarium.com/MI/index.htm), accessed on December 2 ${ }^{\text {nd }}$, 2012)

Minxova, V. 2006. Multiple intelligences and different learning styles in the process of teaching grammar. Brno.

Miska, Amanda. 2004. Classroom modeling: Scaffolding learning or stifling? An inquiry. Retrieved from http://www.ed.psu.edu/englishpds/inquiry/projects/miska04.html, accessed on December $2^{\text {nd }}, 2012$ ).

Nunan, David. 1991. Language teaching methodology (a textbook for teachers). USA: Macquire University.

Richards, J. C. \& Renandya, W. A. 2002. Methodology in language teaching: An anthology of current practice. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Richards, J. C. \& Rodgers, T. S. 2001. Approaches and methods in language teaching. (Second Ed.). New York: Cambridge University Press.

Rajmzoo, S. A. 2008. On the relationship between multiple intelligences and language proficiency. The reading matrix, 8 (2), 155-174.

Sa'diyah, H. 2011. Improving students' ability in writing descriptive texts through a picture series-aided learning strategy. The English Teacher, 40, 164-182.

Sugiyono. 2010. Metode Penelitian Kuantitative Kualitatif dan R\&D. Bandung: Alfabeta.

Wang, Ping. 2009. The inter-rater reliability in scoring composition. English Language Teaching Journal, 2 (3), 1-5.

Yi-an, H. 2010. Multiple intelligences and foreign language learning- $A$ case study in Taiwan. An Interdisciplinary Journal 58, 1-30.

Yule, G. 2010. The study of language. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Zarei, Abbas, A. \& Mohseni, F. 2012. On the relationship between multiple intelligences and grammatical and writing accuracy of Iranian learners of English. US-China foreign language, 10 (7), 1306-1317.

## APPENDIX A

## Questionnaire for students

Please put tick $(\mathrm{V})$ on the right column with the respond that you think suitable with the condition of the statement on the left side.
SA: Strongly Agree
H : Hesitate
SNA: Strongly Not Agree
A : Agree
NA : Not Agree

| NO | Statements | Respond |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{SA} \\ 5 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline \mathrm{A} \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $H$ 3 | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{NA} \\ 2 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { SNA } \\ 1 \end{gathered}$ |
| 1. | I never heard of Multiple intelligences before the teacher explains it to me. |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2. | The application of Multiple Intelligences-Based Activities made me aware of my own intelligence profile. |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3. | I find knowing my intelligence profile helped me a lot to understand my area of strength and weakness. |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4. | Writing class becomes enjoyable with the application of Intelligences-Based Activities. |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5. | When Multiple Intelligences-Based Activities is applied, I do not think of writing as a difficult subject. |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6. | When Multiple Intelligences-Based Activities is applied, I feel that time running fast. |  |  |  |  |  |
| 7. | Multiple Intelligences-Based Activities makes me |  |  |  |  |  |


|  | become more creative about ideas that I want to write. |  |  |  |  |  |
| ---: | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 8. | I enjoy every activity in the application of Multiple <br> Intelligences-Based Activities. |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9. | Multiple Intelligences-Based Activities is suitable to be <br> applied in Writing subject. |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10. | I think that it will be better if (skills) class are also <br> applied with Multiple Intelligences-Based Activities. |  |  |  |  |  |

5. Do you think the application of Multiple Intelligences-Based Activities promote your writing performance? How?
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
6. Which part of the application of Multiple Intelligences-Based Activities that you dislike the most? $\qquad$
$\qquad$
7. If you can add more activity to your writing class, what would you suggest? $\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
8. Which part of the application of Multiple Intelligences-Based Activities that you like the most? $\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

## APPENDIX B

## The worksheet for pre-test

Class:.................. No:.................... Name:
Write a narrative essay on the story of "SNOW WHITE".
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

APPENDIX C
The worksheet for post-test
Class:
No:
Name:

## Write a narrative essay on the story of "SNOW WHITE"

$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

## APPENDIX D

## Multiple Intelligences (M.I.) Inventory

© 1999 Walter McKenzie (http://surfaquarium.com/MI/index.htm)

Complete each section by placing a "1" next to each statement you feel accurately describes you. If you do not identify with a statement, leave the space provided blank. Then total the column in each section.

## Section 1

$\qquad$ I enjoy categorizing things by common traits
$\qquad$ Ecological (environmental) issues are important to me
$\qquad$ Hiking and camping are enjoyable activities
$\qquad$ I enjoy working on a garden
$\qquad$ I believe preserving (saving/keeping) our National Parks is important
$\qquad$ Putting things in hierarchies (system of levels) makes sense to me
___ Animals are important in my life
$\qquad$ My home has a recycling system in place
$\qquad$ I enjoy studying biology, botany and/or zoology

## $\qquad$ I spend a great deal of time outdoors

TOTAL $\qquad$

## Section 2

$\qquad$ I easily pick up on patterns
$\qquad$ I focus in on noise and sounds
$\qquad$ Moving to a beat is easy for me
$\qquad$ l've always been interested in playing an instrument
$\qquad$ The cadence (rhythm/speed) of poetry intrigues me
$\qquad$ I remember things by putting them in a rhyme
$\qquad$ Concentration is difficult while listening to a radio or television
$\qquad$ I enjoy many kinds of music
$\qquad$ Musicals are more interesting than dramatic plays
$\qquad$ Remembering song lyrics is easy for me
$\qquad$

## Section 3

$\qquad$ I keep my things neat and orderly
$\qquad$ Step-by-step directions are a big help
$\qquad$ Solving problems comes easily to me
$\qquad$ I get easily frustrated with disorganized people
$\qquad$ I can complete calculations quickly in my head
$\qquad$ Puzzles requiring reasoning are fun
$\qquad$ I can't begin an assignment until all my questions are answered
$\qquad$ Structure helps me be successful
$\qquad$ I find working on a computer spreadsheet or database rewarding
$\qquad$ Things have to make sense to me or I am dissatisfied
TOTAL $\qquad$

## Section 4

$\qquad$ I learn best interacting with others
$\qquad$ "The more the merrier"
$\qquad$ Study groups are very productive for me
$\qquad$ I enjoy chat rooms
$\qquad$ Participating in politics is important
$\qquad$ Television and radio talk shows are enjoyable
$\qquad$ I am a "team player"
$\qquad$ I dislike working alone
$\qquad$ Clubs and extracurricular activities are fun
$\qquad$ I pay attention to social issues and causes
TOTAL $\qquad$

## Section 5

$\qquad$ I enjoy making things with my hands
$\qquad$ Sitting still for long periods of time is difficult for me
$\qquad$ I enjoy outdoor games and sports
$\qquad$ I value non-verbal communication such as sign language
$\qquad$ A fit body is important for a fit mind
___ Arts and crafts are enjoyable pastimes
$\qquad$ Expression through dance is beautiful
$\qquad$ I like working with tools
$\qquad$ I live an active lifestyle
$\qquad$ I learn by doing
TOTAL $\qquad$

## Section 6

___ I enjoy reading all kinds of materials
$\qquad$ Taking notes helps me remember and understand
$\qquad$ I faithfully (routinely/always) contact friends through letters and/or email
$\qquad$ It is easy for me to explain my ideas to others
$\qquad$ I keep a journal
$\qquad$ Word puzzles like crosswords and jumbles are fun
$\qquad$ I write for pleasure
$\qquad$ I enjoy playing with words like puns, anagrams and spoonerisms
$\qquad$ Foreign languages interest me
$\qquad$ Debates and public speaking are activities I like to participate in TOTAL $\qquad$

## Section 7

$\qquad$ I am keenly aware of my moral beliefs
$\qquad$ I learn best when I have an emotional attachment to the subject
$\qquad$ Fairness is important to me
$\qquad$ My attitude effects how I learn
$\qquad$ Social justice issues concern me
$\qquad$ Working alone can be just as productive as working in a group
$\qquad$ I need to know why I should do something before I agree to do it
$\qquad$ When I believe in something I will give $100 \%$ effort to it
$\qquad$ I like to be involved in causes that help others I am willing to protest or sign a petition to right a wrong TOTAL $\qquad$

## Section 8

$\qquad$ I can imagine ideas in my mind
$\qquad$ Rearranging a room is fun for me
$\qquad$ I enjoy creating art using varied media
$\qquad$ I remember well using graphic organizers
$\qquad$ Performance art can be very gratifying
$\qquad$ Spreadsheets are great for making charts, graphs and tables
$\qquad$ Three-dimensional puzzles bring me much enjoyment
$\qquad$ Music videos are very stimulating
$\qquad$ I can recall things in mental pictures
$\qquad$ I am good at reading maps, atlases and blueprints TOTAL $\qquad$

## APPENDIX E

Time Table of Applying Multiple Intelligences-Based Activities

The table bellow shows the activities in this research based on the way it divided into several meetings:

| Meetings | Application of Multiple Intelligences-Based Activities |
| :---: | :---: |
| Meeting 1 | - Students will take their pre-test. |
| Meeting 2 | - The researcher will give the students explanation about multiple intelligences-based activities that the researcher intends to use to promote students' writing performance. <br> - The students will be taking their MI inventory to find out the students' MI profile. <br> - The researcher explains what is MI profile and answer students' question related to the MI profile. |
| Meeting 3 | - Students reads handout, narrative short stories, silently (see attachment 1,2,3) <br> - Students will categorize the organization of each of the narrative story <br> - Brain storming about the organization of narratives through classroom discussion. <br> - In group, students should create a narrative story of their own and they can choose their own story starters to help them along the way (see attachment 4). |
| Meeting 4 | - Students should be able to use their imagination to projects lyrics of a song into the form of creative writing (see attachment 5). <br> - Students should be able to write a scene based on a song. <br> - Students should be able to practice creative writing. |
| Meeting 5 | - Students will be given work sheet of pictures aided story (see attachment 6 \& 7). <br> - Students will need to sit in pairs. <br> - Each of them (in pairs) will be given different set of picture aided story from their pair. <br> - The set of pictures given to the students is not in its sequential order, they need to re-arrange the story firstly. <br> - Students will write the story based on the pictures on their work sheet. <br> - Students will exchange pictures-aided story they made with their pair. |
| Meeting 6 | - Students will be given a fable story and divided into 4 groups. <br> - Students will have to identify the message and organization of fable narratives (see attachment 8, 9, 10, 11). <br> - Students will need to use categorize the "bad" and the "good" character of the story and identify the nature of the characters. <br> - Classroom discussion on fables in narrative writing. |


|  | - Students will practice their creative writing focusing on fable. |
| :---: | :---: |
| Meeting 7 | - The class will be divided into some groups, and each member of the group will contribute to this game, each group have 5 members. <br> - This is a competitive game, one student "demonstrator", will act out a certain role related to some character in narrative story. The demonstrator get $\mathbf{3 0}$ seconds to get others to guess the character he is playing. <br> - Each group will discuss who will play as "demonstrator", the demonstrator will demonstrate whatever characters that they picked. <br> - The characters are written in a piece of paper in a bowl where the demonstrator put his hand in and take one of the papers. <br> - The other member of the group should guess the character that the demonstrator played. <br> - The demonstrator should not make any voice at all, she/he can only use hand gestures and body language. <br> - Each demonstrator needs their friend to guess as many character as possible, the winner is the group who guess the most characters. |
| Meeting 8 | - Students will take their post-test. <br> - The students will be interviewed by the researcher to find out students' perception toward the application of Multiple IntelligencesBased Activities. |

## APPENDIX F

Extended Version of Jacobs et. al Writing Scale
(Jacobs et al. (1981) as cited in Hughes, 2003, p. 104)

Content

| ASPECT | SCORE | LEVEL/ CRITERIA |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\begin{aligned} & \underset{\sim}{2} \\ & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{2} \\ & \hline 0 \end{aligned}$ | 30-27 | EXCELLENT TO VERY GOOD: knowledgeable • substantive thorough development of thesis • relevant to assigned topic |
|  | 26-22 | GOOD TO AVERAGE: some knowledge of subject • adequate range - limited development of thesis - mostly relevant to the topic, but lacks detail |
|  | 21-17 | FAIR TO POOR: limited knowledge of subject • little substance inadequate development of topic |
|  | 16-13 | VERY POOR: does not show knowledge of subject • nonsubstantive • not pertinent • OR not enough to evaluate |

30 (excellent) : present a clear understanding about the subject, substantive, main points related to the topic are discussed, both major and minor details are clearly illustrated and without any extraneous materials.
29 (excellent) : presents a clear understanding about the subject, substantive, main points related to the topic are discussed, major details are clearly (thoroughly) illustrated, missing 1-2 minor details that do not affect the overall content, no extraneous materials.

28 (very Good) : presents a clear understanding about the subject, mostly substantive, main points related to the topic are discussed, major details are presented but missing some minor details(3-4) yet the whole content was not affected, no extraneous materials.
27(very good) : presents a clear understanding about the subject, mostly substantive, some main points related to the topic are presented, major details are complete but missing several minor details (5-6), no extraneous materials.

26 (good) : presents some knowledge (missing 1-2 description of characterrefer to materials for raters training) of the subject, presents adequate range (missing 1-2 major points) of main points, development of thesis are complete but limited,
mostly relevant to subject, major details are discussed but lacks in minor detail (only 3-4 presented), there are some extraneous materials
25 (good) : presents some knowledge (missing 1-2 description of characterrefer to C 1 in raters training) of the subject, presents adequate range (missing 3 major points) of the main points, development of thesis are complete but limitedly elaborated, few minor details are missing (only 3-4 presented), there are some extraneous materials
24 (average) : presents some knowledge of the subject, presents adequate range of main points (missing 3 major points), development of thesis are complete but limited (it is mentioned but only limitedly elaborated, refer to C-3 in raters training), only major details are discussed, less minor details, there are some extraneous materials

23 (average) : presents some knowledge of the subject, presents less ranged main points, development of thesis are complete but limited (it is mentioned but only limitedly elaborated, refer to C-3 in raters training), only major details are discussed, most minor details are missing, there are some extraneous materials

22 (average) : presents some knowledge of the subject, presents less ranged main points (missing 4 major points), development of thesis are complete but limited, only major details are discussed (limitedly) with less minor details, there are some extraneous materials

21 (fair) : limited knowledge of the subject (present either physical description or inner character of the subjects, around 3 out of 6 subjects) (refer to C-1 in raters training), little substance, only few main points are discussed, inadequate development of topic that does not convey the sense of completeness, missing 1 major detail with little minor details, shows communication breakdown 20 (fair) : limited knowledge of the subject (present either physical description or inner character of the subjects, around 3 out of 6 subjects), only few main points are discussed, inadequate development of thesis that does not convey the sense of completeness, missing 1-2 major details with less minor details, shows communication breakdown

19 (fair) : limited knowledge of the subject (present either physical description or inner character of the subjects around 2 out of 6 subjects), only few main points are discussed, inadequate development of thesis that does not convey the sense of completeness, missing major details with the absence of minor details, shows communication breakdown

18 (Poor) : less understanding of the subjects (only mention name of the subject, no identification of subjects are presented), less main points discussed, inadequate development of thesis that does not convey the sense of completeness, missing 4-5 major details with the absence of minor details, shows communication breakdown

17 (Poor) : less understanding of the subject (only mention name of the subject, no identification of subjects are presented), less main point discussed, inadequate development of thesis that does not convey the sense of completeness, missing 5-6 major details with the absence of minor details, shows communication breakdown.

16 (very poor) : does not show knowledge of the subject (some main character are not mentioned), non substantive, not pertinent (not relevance to the subject), shows communication break down

15 (very poor) : does not show knowledge of the subject (some main character are not mentioned), non substantive that makes it hard to find the main point of the discussion, not pertinent, shows severe communication break down

14 (very poor) : does not show any knowledge of the subject (most main character are not mentioned), not substantive or does not present the main point of the discussion, not pertinent, shows severe communication break down

13 (very poor) : does not show any knowledge of the subject, Not enough to evaluate

Organization

|  | 20-18 | EXCELLENT TO VERY GOOD: fluent expression • ideas clearly stated/ supported • succinct • well-organized • logical sequencing • cohesive |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 17-14 | GOOD TO AVERAGE: somewhat choppy • loosely organized but main ideas stand out - limited support - logical but incomplete sequencing |
|  | 13-10 | FAIR TO POOR: non-fluent • ideas confused or disconnected • lacks logical sequencing and development |
|  | 9-7 | VERY POOR: does not communicate • no organization • OR not enough to evaluate |

20 (excellent) : fluent expression (the ideas flows smoothly and are building one another), ideas are clearly stated and supported, all ideas are directed concisely to the central focus of the subject, well-organized (there are beginning, middle and end of paragraph), presents logical sequencing and supported by the correct use of transitional markers, cohesive.
19 (very good): fluent expression, ideas are clearly stated and supported, most ideas are directed concisely to the central focus of the subject, well-organized, presents some logical sequencing, cohesive.
18 (very good): the flow of ideas are clear (not quite smoothly but clear), ideas are clearly stated and but not all ideas are well-supported (refer to the raters training), well-organized, presents some logical sequencing, cohesive.

17 (good) : shows flow of ideas but sometimes choppy (wavy, or talk about something different for a while), loosely organized but main ideas stand out, ideas are clearly stated but limitedly supported, logical but incomplete sequencing.

16 (good) : shows flow of ideas but sometimes choppy (wavy, or talk about something different for a while), loosely organized but main ideas stand out, ideas are sometimes not directed to the central focus of the paper and are limitedly supported, logical but incomplete sequencing.
15 (average) : limited development of ideas, sometimes choppy, organization is unclear but main ideas still stated, limited of introductory, body and conclusion, the logical sequencing of the points are limitedly developed,

14 (average) : limited development of ideas, mostly choppy, organization is unclear but main ideas are still stated, very limited of introductory, body and conclusion, the logical sequencing of the points are limitedly developed

13 (fair) : non-fluent (the flow of ideas are not clear), development of ideas are limited, some ideas are confused or disconnected, and lacks logical sequencing,
12 (fair) : non-fluent, development of ideas are limited, some ideas are confused and disconnected, few logical sequencing.
11 (Poor) : ideas are hardly fluent, limited development of ideas, most of ideas are disconnected or confused, very little logical sequencing.

10 (poor) : ideas are mostly not developed, confusing and disconnected, no logical sequencing.

9 (very poor) : ideas presented does not communicate, no organization
8 (very poor) : very limited ideas presented are disconnected, no organization
7 (very poor) : not enough to evaluate

Vocabulary

| 20-18 | EXCELLENT TO VERY GOOD: sophisticated range • effective <br> word/ idiom choice and usage • word form mastery <br> appropriate register <br> GOOD TO AVERAGE: adequate range • occasional errors of |
| :---: | :---: | :--- |
| word/ idiom form, choice, usage but meaning not obscured |  |
| (17-14 | FAIR TO POOR: limited range • frequent errors of word/ idiom <br> form, choice, usage • meaning confused or obscured <br> 9ERY POOR: essential translation • little knowledge of English <br> vocabulary, idioms, word form • OR not enough to evaluate |

20 (excellent) : sophisticated range, effective word/idiom choice and usage, shows word form mastery, shows appropriate register.

19 (very good): used wide range variety of words, effective word/idiom choice and usage (2-3), shows word form mastery and appropriate register.

18 (very good): illustrate some range variety of words, some miss-used of word/idiom choice (3-4) and usage (not more than 2), shows word form mastery, shows appropriate register.

17 (good) : adequate range variety of words, occasional errors on words/idioms form (around 4-5), choice and usage (3-4) but meaning are not obscured.
16 (good) : adequate range of variety of words, occasional errors (more than 4) on words/idioms form, choice and usage (4-5) but meaning are not obscured.
15 (average) : some range of words are provided, some erroneous on words/idioms form (around 7-8) , choice and usage but doesn't obscure meaning.

14 (average) : some range of words are provided with some erroneous on words/ idioms form, choice and usage but meaning are not obscured yet the percentage of the errors are bigger than point (15)

13 (Fair) : limited range of words, frequent errors of words/idiom form choice and usage (around $50 \%$ of the overall errors combined) that cause meaning to be confused or obscured.

12 (Fair) : limited range of words, frequent by errors of words/idiom form , choice and usage (around 60-70\% of the overall errors combined) that leads to confused or obscured meaning.
11 (poor) : words are hardly ranged, dominated (around 75-80\%) by errors of words/idioms form, choice and usage that leads to confused or obscured meaning 10 (poor) : words are not ranged at all, mostly (85-90\%) erroneous of words/idioms form, choice and usage that make the meaning confused and obscured.

9 (very poor) : essentially translation, little knowledge of English vocabulary, idioms, and word form

8 (very poor) : essentially translation shows very limited knowledge of English vocabulary, idioms and word form
7 (very poor) :Not enough to evaluate.
Language Use

|  | 25-22 | EXCELLENT TO VERY GOOD: effective complex constructions <br> - few errors of agreement, tense, number, word order/ function, <br> articles, pronouns, prepositions |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 21-18 | GOOD TO AVERAGE: effective but simple constructions o minor problems in complex constructions - several errors of agreement, tense, number, word order/ function, articles, pronouns, prepositions but meaning seldom obscured |
|  | 17-11 | FAIR TO POOR: major problems in simple/ complex constructions - frequent errors of negation, agreement, tense, number, word order/ function, articles, pronouns, prepositions and/ or fragments, run-ons, deletions - meaning confused or obscured |
|  | 10-5 | VERY POOR: virtually no mastery of sentence construction rules - dominated by errors • does not communicate - OR not enough to evaluate. |

25 (excellent) : show effective complex construction, few errors on agreement, tense, number, word/order function, articles, pronouns and preposition (only 10-11 errors on all these combined, e.g, 2 errors in agreement, 2 in tense, 1 in pronouns and 1 in preposition and so on)
24 (excellent) : effective complex construction, several errors on agreement, tense, number, word/order function, articles, pronouns and preposition (14-15 errors combined).
23(very good) : show affective complex construction (but few flawed), several errors on agreement, tense, number, word/order function, articles, pronouns and preposition (16-20 errors combined),
22 (very good) : show affective complex construction (but few flawed), several errors on agreement, tense, number, word/order function, articles, pronouns and preposition 21-26 errors combined).
All errors in this section are still around $5-25 \%$ of the overall paper)

21 (Good) : effective but simple construction, minor problems in complex constructions, several errors of agreement tense, number, word/order function, articles, pronouns and preposition ( about 27-30 errors combined).
20 (good) : effective in simple construction but few major problems appear in complex construction, several errors of agreement tense, number, word/order function, articles, pronouns and preposition ( about 31-34 errors combined).
19 (average) : hardly presents effective complex constructions (the complex constructions produced were ineffective), shows several problems in simple construction, several errors of
agreement tense, number, word/order function, articles, pronouns and preposition ( about 3135 errors combined) and meaning seldom confused or obscured.

18 (average) : mostly simple construction with some minor problems, hardly presents any complex constructions, neither effective (the complex constructions produced were ineffective), shows some few problems in simple construction, several errors of agreement tense, number, word/order function, articles, pronouns and preposition ( about 34-40 errors combined) and meaning seldom confused or obscured.
(All errors in this section are still around $25-50 \%$ of the overall paper)

17 (fair): major problems in simple/complex construction, frequent errors in negation, agreement, tense, number, word order/function, articles, pronouns, preposition, and or fragments, run-ons, deletions, meaning confused or obscured. (Errors are around 50-55\% of the overall paper)
16 (fair): major problems in simple/complex construction, frequent errors in negation, agreement, tense, number, word order/function, articles, pronouns, preposition, and or fragments, run-ons, deletions, meaning confused or obscured. (Errors are around 55-60\% of the overall paper)
15 (fair): major problems in simple/complex construction, frequent errors in negation, agreement, tense, number, word order/function, articles, pronouns, preposition, and or fragments, run-ons, deletions, meaning confused or obscured. (Errors are around 60-65\% of the overall paper)
14 (fair): major problems in simple/complex construction, mostly errors in negation, agreement, tense, number, word order/function, articles, pronouns, preposition, and or fragments, run-ons, deletions, meaning confused or obscured. (Errors are around 65-70\% of the overall paper)

13 (poor) : only present simple construction with some major problems, mostly errors in negation, agreement, tense, number, word order/function, articles, pronouns, preposition, and or fragments, run-ons, deletions, meaning confused or obscured. (Errors are around 70$75 \%$ of the overall paper)

12(poor) : only present simple construction with some major problems, mostly errors in negation, agreement, tense, number, word order/function, articles, pronouns, preposition, and or fragments, run-ons, deletions, meaning confused or obscured. (Errors are around 75$80 \%$ of the overall paper)

11 (poor) : only present simple construction with some major problems, mostly errors in negation, agreement, tense, number, word order/function, articles, pronouns, preposition, and or fragments, run-ons, deletions, meaning confused or obscured. (Errors are around 80$85 \%$ of the overall paper)

10 (very poor) : virtually no mastery of sentence constructions rules, dominated by errors, (85-90 \% of the paper are dominated by errors)
9 (very poor) : virtually no mastery of sentence constructions rules, dominated by errors, does not communicate

8 (very poor) : virtually no mastery of sentence constructions rules, dominated by errors, does not communicate at all (the sentences constructed are hardly recognizable)
7 (very poor) : virtually no mastery of sentence constructions rules, mostly errors on paper, the meaning can hardly be recognized)

6 (very poor) : the length of the paper is not much (still enough but mostly errors)
5 (very poor) : not enough to evaluate

## Mechanics

| $\begin{aligned} & 0 \\ & \sum_{2}^{2} \\ & \text { N } \\ & \text { O } \\ & \text { M } \end{aligned}$ | 54 | EXCELLENT TO VERY GOOD: demonstrates mastery of conventions |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | GOOD TO AVERAGE: occasional errors of spelling, punctuation, capitalization, paragraphing but meaning not obscured |
|  | 3 | FAIR TO POOR: frequent errors of spelling, punctuation, capitalization, paragraphing $\bullet$ poor handwriting $\bullet$ meaning confused or obscured |
|  | 2 | VERY POOR: no mastery of conventions - dominated by errors of spelling, punctuation, capitalization, paragraphing • handwriting illegible <br> - OR not enough to evaluate |

This part had been clearly explained, several key words (such as poor handwriting, etc) are presented in raters training.

## APPENDIX G

Materials for raters training - going deep inside the terms and quantifiers (some, $\underline{\text { few, little) }}$

Based on (Jacobs et al. (1981) as cited in Hughes, 2003, p. 104)

Content
C-1 : knowledgeable - presents a clear understanding about the subjects - presents different aspects of the subjects.

- Presents physical description and inner character of the main characters like Snow White, The Queen, The Prince, the kingdom, the dwarves, and the dwarfs' cottage. The more descriptive, the better, e.g. physical description like snow white's skin, or her beauty,
- And the inner character of the subjects like how the queen was the embodiment of evil, or how the prince was head over heels about Snow White the first time he saw her.
C-2 : substantive - all main points are discussed - both major and minor details are presented.
- Major details included

1. Snow White's state of losing her mother and having a new step mother.
2. She lost her father afterwards
3. The Queen tendencies of being the fairest in the land acknowledged by her Magic mirror
4. The Queen's jealousy toward Snow White
5. The Queen's plot to kill Snow White by ordering the huntsmen
6. Snow White run toward the Forrest
7. Snow White met the Dwarfs
8. The Queen found out that Snow White was still alive.
9. The Queen decided to kill Snow White using poisoned apple
10. The Prince saw and fall for Snow White
11. Snow White woke up and The Prince took her away with him.

- Minor details include

1. Snow White was describes as prettier than her step mother
2. The dialogue involving the mirror telling the Queen that Snow White was prettier
3. The huntsmen was summoned by the Queen and ordered to kill Snow white and bring her heart to the Queen.
4. The huntsmen let go of snow white
5. Snow White found a cottage and clean and fall asleep
6. Snow white lived together with the dwarfs
7. Description on how the Queen found Snow White and gave her the poison apple.
8. The dwarfs put her in a glass coffin
9. The Queen paid for what she did.

C-3 : thorough development of thesis

- Based on oxford : thorough means = doing things very carefully and with great attention to details
- Details are not only mentioned but also elaborated to convey the connectivity to the overall content and convey the sense of completeness. Refer to the details above and see how these details are elaborated and expanded.

C-4 : relevant to assigned topic means all the things being talked about are related to the topic without any extraneous materials at all. Oxford defines extraneous as something that is not important or not connected with the subject or the situation.

Organization
O-1 : fluent expression is related to the flow of the ideas, and how it builds one another.

- Presents the introductory, body and concluding paragraph.
- The flows need to make sense and not overlap with one another.
- The movement from one detail to the other was build easily.
- Presents effective transition in the body of the paper to indicate the movement of ideas.

O-2 : ideas are clearly stated and supported. The paper needs to be divided in several paragraphs, in which each of the paragraphs was built around a single idea and that idea is both clearly stated and well supported.

O-3 : all ideas directed concisely to the central focus of the paper, without digression.
O-4 : Well-Organized - the overall relationship of the ideas within and between paragraphs are clearly indicated. The beginning, middle and end of the paper is clear.
O-5 : Logical Sequencing - the points stated throughout the paper are logically developed using particular sequence like time order (e. g. years ago, the next day and so on). the developments of this logical points are indicated by appropriate transitional markers, (e. g. however, a few years later).
O-6 :Cohesive - something consist of parts that fit together well and form a united whole.

## Vocabulary

V-1 : Sophisticated Range - the range of vocabularies in the paper is sophisticated when it is facilitated with words and idioms with the qualities bellow:

1. When it can convey the intended information, attitudes and feelings.
2. When it can distinguish subtleties among ideas and intention.
3. When it can convey shades and differences of meaning.
4. When it express the logic of ideas

V-2 : effective word/idiom choice and usage - it is effective when it is facilitated with the qualities bellow

1. The accurate choice of vocabulary.
2. The use of idiomatic expression that convey the intended meaning.
3. The correct use of words to emphasize any intended ideas.
4. There are denotative and connotative meanings.
5. The correct use of transition elements to mark shifts in thoughts.

V-3 : word form mastery includes the accurate use of affixes, suffixes and etc.

V -- 4 : the register was considered appropriate when it meets the quality bellow

1. The vocabulary chosen is appropriate to both the topic and audience
2. The familiarity of the vocabulary to the audience
3. The vocabulary chosen make the intended impression.
4. Delivered the exact tone of the paper (the general character of the paper)

V -- $5 \quad$ : appropriate register means the use of vocabulary that is appropriate to the topic.
(language use and mechanics have been stated quite clearly)
Quantity words are often used in the scale to refer to show the difference of numbers of something in the scale itself. Percentage is used to acknowledge such difference, the description can be seen as follows:

- Most (mostly) is about 95-99\% of something
- Some is about $85-90 \%$ of something
- several is about $75 \%-84 \%$ of something
- Adequate is about 65-74 \% of something
- Limited is about $50-64 \%$ of something
- Few means a small number of something around 44-49\% of something
- Less is around $35-43$ \% (if the quality of something is 10 than less means around 3 qualities are being described).
- Very little/very limited means only 1-2 of the expectation (\%0-34 only)
- Occasional means something that is not very often or not in regular intervals (around 20-30\%)
- Poor handwriting means the handwriting was distracting and the raters find it hard to acknowledge the flow and meaning of the paper due to the handwriting itself.
- Handwriting illegible means nothing can be read nor understood due to the poor handwriting.


## Appendix H

## Raters' Reliability

a. Intra-Class Correlation Coefficient Pre-raters' Training

| Sample | Raters |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Rater 1 | Rater 2 | Rater 3 |
| Student A | 65 | 75 | 40 |
| Student B | 43 | 50 | 40 |
| Student C | 80 | 75 | 60 |
| Student D | 80 | 80 | 43 |
| Student E | 85 | 70 | 52 |



The intraclass correlation coefficient of three raters is 0,555 (low correlation) with significance . 023 .
b. Intra-Class Correlation Coefficient Post-raters' Training

| Sample | Raters |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | Rater 1 | Rater 2 | Rater 3 |


| Student A | 61 | 65 | 65 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Student B | 46 | 48 | 56 |
| Student C | 89 | 82 | 85 |
| Student D | 55 | 50 | 57 |
| Student E | 86 | 89 | 87 |


| Intraclass Correlation Coefficient |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | IntraclassCorr elation ${ }^{\text {a }}$ | 95\% Confidence Interval |  | F Test with True Value 0 |  |  |  |
|  |  | Lowe r Bound | Uppe r Bound | Value | df1 | df2 | Sig |
| Single Measures | . $961{ }^{\text {b }}$ | . 839 | . 995 | 78.201 | 4 | 8 | . 000 |
| Average Measures | . 987 | . 940 | . 998 | 7 8.201 | 4 | 8 | .00 0 |

The intra-class correlation coefficient of three raters is 0,987 (high correlation) with significant at .000 .

APPENDIX I

## Appendix J

Classification on Students' Writing Score on Pretest

| o | Students <br> of Control Group | Pretest Control | lassifica tion | Students of Experimental Group | Pretest <br> Experimental | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{Cl} \\ \text { assificati } \\ \text { on } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | ID | $9^{8}$ |  | TRM | 76 | ${ }_{\text {ood }}{ }^{\mathrm{G}}$ |
|  | N | $7^{8}$ |  | TTM | 46 | ${ }_{\text {or }} \mathrm{Po}^{\text {a }}$ |
|  | AN | $2^{9}$ | $$ | SB | 57 | ${ }_{\text {ir }}{ }^{\mathrm{Fa}}$ |
|  | SHA |  | ${ }_{\text {ood }}$ | NK | 48 | ${ }_{\text {or }}{ }^{\mathrm{Po}}$ |
|  | VP |  | ${ }_{\text {oor }}$ | IT | 87 | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{V} \\ \text { ery Good } \end{array}$ |
|  | HD |  | ${ }_{\text {ood }}$ | R | 84 | G |
|  | RD |  | ${ }_{\text {air }}{ }^{F}$ | IH | 80 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { God } \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |
|  | TO | $5^{9}$ |  | MTA | 93 | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{V} \\ \text { ery Good } \end{array}$ |
|  | TJ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{P} \\ & \text { oor } \end{aligned}$ | W | 78 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { G } \\ & \text { ood } \end{aligned}$ |
| 0 | EJU | $5^{3}$ | ery Poor | IPS | 73 | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{Fa} \\ \text { irly Good } \end{array}$ |
| 1 | SK |  | $\begin{gathered} \text { airly } \\ \text { Good } \end{gathered}$ | AU | 59 | ${ }_{\text {ir }}{ }^{\mathrm{Fa}}$ |
| 2 | AM |  | ${ }_{\text {oor }}$ | H | 85 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { ood } \end{aligned}$ |
| 3 | FL |  | ${ }_{\text {oor }}$ | DA | 56 | ir |
| 4 | MT |  | ${ }_{\text {oor }}$ | TUP | 63 | ${ }_{\text {ir }} \mathrm{Fa}$ |
| 5 | BM | $0^{6}$ | ${ }_{\text {air }} \mathrm{F}$ | MK | 64 | ${ }_{\text {ir }}{ }^{\mathrm{Fa}}$ |
| 6 | PL |  | ${ }_{\text {oor }}{ }^{\mathrm{P}}$ | NR | 66 | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{Fa} \\ \text { irly Good } \end{array}$ |
| 7 | SMR | $0^{5}$ | ${ }^{\mathrm{P}}$ | NP | 68 | irly Good |
| 8 | ES | $3^{5}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{P} \\ & \text { oor } \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | AO | 59 | ${ }_{\text {ir }} \mathrm{Fa}$ |
| 9 | FWL |  | ${ }_{\text {ood }}$ | Y | 77 | ood |
| 0 | HH | $5^{6}$ | ${ }_{\text {air }} \mathrm{F}$ | PH | 89 | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{V} \\ \text { ery Good } \end{array}$ |
|  | TOTAL | $266$ |  | TOTAL | $87^{1406,}$ |  |

## Classification on Students' Writing Score on Posttest

| o | Students <br> of Control Group | Pretest <br> Control | lassifica tion | Students of Experimental Group | Pretest <br> Experimental | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{Cl} \\ \text { assificati } \\ \text { on } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | ID | $5^{9}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Very } \\ \text { Good } \end{gathered}$ | TRM | 94 | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{V} \\ \text { ery Good } \end{array}$ |
|  | N |  |  | TTM | 65 | ${ }_{i r} \mathrm{Fa}$ |
|  | AN | $6^{9}$ |  | SB | 70 | Fa <br> irly Good |
|  | SHA | $0^{9}$ |  | NK | 62 | ${ }_{\text {ir }}{ }^{\mathrm{Fa}}$ |
|  | VP | $5^{6}$ | ${ }_{\text {air }}{ }^{F}$ | IT | 95 | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{V} \\ \text { ery Good } \end{array}$ |
|  | HD | $9^{8}$ |  | R | 97 | xcellent |
|  | RD | $9^{6}$ | ${ }_{\text {air }}{ }^{\mathrm{F}}$ | IH | 89 | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{V} \\ \text { ery Good } \end{array}$ |
|  | TO |  | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{E} \\ \text { xcellent } \end{array}$ | MTA | 99 | $\overline{\mathrm{E}}$ <br> xcellent |
|  | TJ | $\begin{array}{r} 5 \\ 4 \end{array}$ | ${ }_{\text {oor }}$ | W | 95 | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{V} \\ \text { ery Good } \\ \hline \end{array}$ |
| 0 | EJU |  | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{P} \\ & \text { oor } \end{aligned}$ | IPS | 92 | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{V} \\ \text { ery Good } \\ \hline \end{array}$ |
| 1 | SK |  | ${ }^{\text {ood }}$ | AU | 75 | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{Fa} \\ \text { irly Good } \end{array}$ |
| 2 | AM |  | ${ }_{\text {air }} \mathrm{F}$ | H | 97 | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{E} \\ \text { xcellent } \end{array}$ |
| 3 | FL |  | $\begin{gathered} \text { Firly } \\ \text { Good } \end{gathered}$ | DA | 71 | irly Good |
| 4 | MT |  | ${ }_{\text {air }} \mathrm{F}$ | TUP | 78 | ${ }_{\operatorname{ood}}$ |
| 5 | BM |  | $\begin{gathered} \text { airly } \\ \text { Good } \end{gathered}$ | MK | 90 | ery Good |
| 6 | PL |  | ${ }_{\text {air }}{ }^{F}$ | NR | 88 | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{V} \\ \text { ery Good } \end{array}$ |
| 7 | SMR |  | ${ }_{\text {air }} \mathrm{F}$ | NP | 84 | God |
| 8 | ES |  | ${ }_{\text {air }}{ }^{F}$ | AO | 73 | Fa irly Good |
| 9 | FWL | $\begin{array}{r} 8 \\ 5^{8} \\ \hline \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { God } \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | Y | 93 | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{V} \\ \text { ery Good } \end{array}$ |


|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0 | HH | $4^{7}$ | Firly <br> Good | PH | 98 |
| TOTAL | $4^{1}$ |  | TOTAL | 1705 |  |

## APPENDIX K

## Cinderella

Once upon a time, there was a girl called Cinderella. Cinderella is lived happily with her mother and father until her mother died. Feel that Cinderella needs a mother figure in his life, Cinderella's father remarries to a woman who has two daughters of her own. Unfortunately, Cinderella's father dies and she lived only with her stepmother and stepsisters.
They were very bossy, she had to do all the housework. One day on invitation to the hall come to the family. The King invited for all the eligible ladies in the kingdom so as to find Prince a wife. Her stepsisters would not let her go. Cinderella was sad. The stepsisters went to the hall without her. Fortunately, the fairy Godmother came and helped her to get to the hall with the wave of magic wand, helped prepared Cinderella for the hall.

The fairy does warn her that is magic will end at a stroke of midnight, so she must leaved the hall before then. At the hall all people surprised when Cinderella arrived. And then the Prince invited Cinderella to dance. He fell in love with her. All of a sudden, the clock star to chime that is a midnight. Cinderella hastily runs away, dropped a glass slipper as she does so. Cinderella escapes, with nothing from the night left, except from the other glass slipper, which had not changed back. Prince Charming orders his love to be found by means of the odd shoe, and the Grand Duke is sent around the land getting every girl in the land to try on the glass slipper to see if it fits.

Eventually the Grand Duke reaches the residence of Cinderella, but she is nowhere to be seen. The stepsisters frantically try to get the glass slipper to fit so as to wed into royalty, but compatible nothing. The Grand Duke is about to leave as Cinderella finally appears. He orders the messenger to bring forth the glass slipper, yet the stepmother in a last minute attempt to prevent her stepdaughter from better things, causes the messenger to trip, thus broken the fragile shoe into pieces. Yet the arrogant woman hadn't betted on Cinderella produced the other glass slipper, which fits onto Cinderella's foot perfectly.

Very soon, wedding bells ring, and Cinderella married her prince, and they live happily ever after.
Source (http://chillachindiza.blogspot.com/2010/03/narrative-cinderella-story-english.html)

## APPENDIX L

## The Bear and Rabbit

Once upon a time, there lived a bear and a rabbit. The rabbit is a good shot. In contrary, the bear is always clumsy and could not use the arrow.

One day, the bear called over the rabbit and asked the rabbit to take his bow and arrows.

The rabbit was fearing to arouse the bear's anger so he could not refuse it. He went with the bear and shot enough buffalo to satisfy the hungry family. Indeed he shot and killed so many that there were lots of meats left after.

However the bear did not want the rabbit to get any of the meat. The rabbit could not even taste the meat. The poor rabbit would have to go home hungry after his hard day's work.

The bear was the father of five children. Fortunately, the youngest child was very kind to the rabbit. He was very hearty eater. The mother bear always gave him an extra large piece of meat but the youngest child did not eat it. He would take it outside with him and pretended to play ball with the meat. He kicked toward the rabbit's house. When he got close to the door he would give the meat with such a great kick. The meat would fly into the rabbit's house. In this way, the poor rabbit would get his meal. Source (http://bos-sulap.blogspot.com/2011/07/narrative-text-rabbit-andbear.html)

## APPENDIX M

## The Legend of Toba Lake

Once upon time, there was a handsome man. His name was Batara Guru Sahala. He liked fishing. One day, he caught a fish. He was surprised to find out that the fish could talk. The fish begged him to set it free.

Batara Guru could not bear it. He made the fish free. As soon as it was free, the fish changed into a very beautiful woman. She attracted Batara Guru so much. He felt in love with that fish-woman. The woman wanted to marry with him and said that Batara Guru had to keep the secret which she had been a fish. Batara Guru aggreed and promised that he would never tell anybody about it.

They were married happily. They had two daughters. One day Batara Guru got very angry with his daughter. He could not control his mad. He shouted angrily and got the word of fish to his daugters. The daughters were crying. They found their mother and talked her about it.

The mother was very annoyed. Batara Guru broke his promise. The mother was shouting angrily. Then the earth began to shake. Volcanoes started to erupt. The earth formed a very big hole. People believed that the big hole became a lake. Then this lake is known as Toba Lake.
Source (http://folktales4u.blogspot.com/2011/05/legend-of-lake-toba.html)

## APPENDIX N

## The Story Starters

Pick a story starter bellow and write a narrative story with your group, you should discuss the orientation, the complication and the result of the story.

1. Once upon a time, in the land of far-far away, live a very ugly prince, called Prince Boo--
2. An Eagle is flying low to the ground when he saw a delicious snake lying near a huge rock, he was very happy with the idea of having juicy snake for lunch -
3. A Toad was so hungry, that he slowly drag his feet to the ground, he was imagining of having a chocolate cake or maybe flies, whatever food he can have-
4. Years ago, a Cat and a Dog was a very good friend. They played and hang out together every time ---
5. A Kingless Queen- is a suitable nickname for the Queen Sofia, she inherit her crown when her Father King Edward died 4 years ago, ---
6. Long time ago, live a two sister whose beauty is famous across the country. They both were so beautiful, it's hard to tell which one is prettier than the other ----
7. There lived a very beautiful White Witch called Samantha, she was so very kind-hearted that she helped everybody in the village, but Muriel the Dark Witch hated her for that so she $\qquad$

## APPENDIX 0

## Lyrics of the Song

## Someone Like You - By ADELE

I heard that you're settled down
That you found a girl and you're married now
I heard that your dreams came true
Guess she gave you things I didn't give to you
Old friend, why are you so shy?
Ain't like you to hold back or hide from the light
I hate to turn up out of the blue, uninvited
But I couldn't stay away, I couldn't fight it
I had hoped you'd see my face and that you'd be reminded
That for me, it isn't over

Never mind, l'll find someone like you
I wish nothing but the best for you, too
Don't forget me, I begged, I remember you said
Sometimes it lasts in love, but sometimes it hurts instead
Sometimes it lasts in love, but sometimes it hurts instead

You know how the time flies
Only yesterday was the time of our lives
We were born and raised in a summer haze
Bound by the surprise of our glory days
I hate to turn up out of the blue, uninvited
But I couldn't stay away, I couldn't fight it
I had hoped you'd see my face and that you'd be reminded That for me,
it isn't over yet
Never mind, l'll find someone like you
I wish nothing but the best for you, too

Source (http://www.metrolyrics.com/someone-like-you-lyrics-adele.html)

## APPENDIX P

Pictures-Aided Story

SNOW WHITE



Source (http://www.slideshare.net/kamaludinnegarabali/snow-white-ppt)

## APPENDIX Q

Pictures aided-story
HANSEL AND GRETEL




Source (http://www.slideshare.net/52255149/hansel-y-gretel-3258565)

## APPENDIX R

## Fable

Once upon time, a man had a wonderful parrot. There was no other parrot like it. The parrot could say every word, except one word. The parrot would not say the name of the place where it was born. The name of the place was Catano.

The man felt excited having the smartest parrot but he could not understand why the parrot would not say Catano. The man tried to teach the bird to say Catano however the bird kept not saying the word.

At the first, the man was very nice to the bird but then he got very angry. "You stupid bird!" pointed the man to the parrot. "Why can't you say the word? Say Catano! Or I will kill you" the man said angrily. Although he tried hard to teach, the parrot would not say it. Then the man got so angry and shouted to the bird over and over; "Say Catano or l'll kill you". The bird kept not to say the word of Catano.

One day, after he had been trying so many times to make the bird say Catano, the man really got very angry. He could not bear it. He picked the parrot and threw it into the chicken house. There were four old chickens for next dinner "You are as stupid as the chickens. Just stay with them" Said the man angrily. Then he continued to humble; "You know, I will cut the chicken for my meal. Next it will be your turn, I will eat you too, stupid parrot". After that he left the chicken house.

The next day, the man came back to the chicken house. He opened the door and was very surprised. He could not believe what he saw at the chicken house. There were three death chickens on the floor. At the moment, the parrot was standing proudly and screaming at the last old chicken; "Say Catano or l'll kill you"

Source (http://dairyziza.blogspot.com/2013/04/example-of-narrative-textsmartest.html)

## APPENDIX S

## The Monkey and the Crocodile

One day there was a monkey. He wanted to cross a river. There he saw a crocodile so he asked the crocodile to take him across the other side of the river. The crocodile agree and told the monkey to jump on its back. Then the crocodile swam down the river with the monkey on his top.

Unluckily, the crocodile was very hungry, he stopped in the middle of the river and said to the monkey, "My father is very sick. He has to eat the heart of the monkey. So he will be healthy again."

At the time, the monkey was in dangerous situation and he had to think hard. Then he had a good idea. He told the crocodile to swim back to the river bank. "What's for?" asked the crocodile. "Because I don't bring my heart," said the monkey. "I left it under a tree, near some coconuts in the river bank."

The crocodile agreed and turned around. He swam back to the bank of the river. As soon as they reached the river bank, the monkey jumped off the crocodile's back. Then he climbed up to the top of a tree.
"Where is your heart?" asked the crocodile. "You are foolish," said the monkey to the crocodile. "Now I am free and I have my heart.

Source (http://www.longlongtimeago.com/llta_fables_monkeycroc.html)

## APPENDIX T

## Games (GUESS WHO?)

| Characters | Story |
| :---: | :---: |
| The Frog | The Princess and the Frog |
| Malin Kundang | Malin Kundang |
| Cinderella | Cinderella |
| Snow White | Little Red Riding Hood White |
| The Wolf | Beauty and The Beast |
| The Witch | Little Red Riding Hood White |
| Little Red Riding Hood | Snow White |
| Dwarves | Cinderella <br> Hansel and Gretel <br> The Step Sister <br> Hansel <br> The Monkey and The |
| Crocodile |  |

## APPENDIX I

RATERS SCORING

Pretest Control Group

|  | Content |  |  |  | Organiza tion |  |  |  | Vocabula ry |  |  |  | Languag e Use |  |  |  | Mechani <br> C |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Stude <br> nts <br> Name | R <br> 1 | $\mathrm{R}$ $2$ | R $3$ | M | R <br> 1 | R $2$ | R $3$ | M | R $1$ | R $2$ | R $3$ | M | R $1$ | R $2$ | R $3$ | M | R $1$ | R $2$ | R $3$ | M | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{TO} \\ \mathrm{TA} \\ \mathrm{~L} \end{gathered}$ |
| ID | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $2$ $7$ | $2$ $7$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} \hline 1 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} \hline 1 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 9 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | 2 3 | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $2$ $2$ | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 89 |
| N | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $2$ $6$ | $2$ $7$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $7$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $8$ | $1$ $7$ | $1$ $7$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} 1 \\ 7 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 87 |
| AN | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} 2 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} 1 \\ 9 \end{array}$ | $1$ $8$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} 2 \\ 4 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 92 |
| SHA | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $2$ $4$ | $2$ $3$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} 1 \\ 7 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} 1 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} \hline 1 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} \hline 1 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 9 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $2$ $2$ | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 84 |
| VP | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $5$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|l} \hline 1 \\ 4 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 4 \end{array}$ | 9 | 9 | 9 | 9 | 9 | 9 | 9 | 9 | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 44 |
| HD | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $2$ $6$ | $2$ <br> 7 | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $7$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 6 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} \hline 1 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} \hline 1 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} \hline 1 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} 1 \\ 9 \end{array}$ | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 82 |
| RD | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $7$ | $1$ $8$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $3$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $3$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 2 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 3 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|l} 1 \\ 3 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} 1 \\ 3 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $3$ | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 58 |
| TO | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $2$ $9$ | $\begin{aligned} & 3 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} 1 \\ 9 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} \hline 1 \\ 9 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} \hline 1 \\ 9 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} 1 \\ 9 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $2$ $4$ | $2$ $4$ | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 95 |
| TJ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $4$ | $1$ $4$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | 9 | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | 9 | 9 | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|l} 1 \\ 0 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $1$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $1$ | $1$ $1$ | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 46 |
| EJU | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $3$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} \hline 1 \\ 4 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 6 | 6 | 7 | 6 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 35 |
| SK | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $2$ $2$ | $2$ $1$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $4$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|l} \hline 1 \\ 4 \end{array}$ | $1$ $5$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 4 \end{array}$ | $1$ $4$ | 1 5 | 1 5 | 1 5 | 1 4 | 1 4 | 1 5 | 1 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 67 |


| AM | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\left\lvert\, \begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}\right.$ | $\left\lvert\, \begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}\right.$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ | $\left\lvert\, \begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}\right.$ | $1$ | $1$ | $\left\lvert\, \begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}\right.$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ | 1 | $\left\lvert\, \begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}\right.$ | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 49 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| FL | $1$ $7$ | $1$ $6$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $1$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | 1 1 | 1 1 | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 51 |
| MT | $1$ $3$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} 1 \\ 4 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | 7 | 7 | 8 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 37 |
| BM | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{l\|} \hline 2 \\ 0 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $2$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | 1 2 | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 60 |
| PL | $1$ $4$ | $1$ <br> 5 | $1$ $4$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $1$ | $1$ $1$ | $1$ $1$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $1$ | $1$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | 8 | 8 | 9 | 8 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 45 |
| SMR | $1$ $7$ | $1$ $7$ | $1$ $8$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | 1 1 | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 50 |
| ES | $1$ $5$ | $1$ $5$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | 1 | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | 1 1 | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 53 |
| FWL | $2$ $4$ | $2$ $4$ | $2$ $5$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $6$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 6 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | 1 | 1 | $\begin{array}{\|l} 1 \\ 7 \end{array}$ | 1 8 | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 77 |
| HH | $2$ <br> 1 | $2$ $2$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 6 \end{array}$ | $1$ $6$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} \hline 1 \\ 7 \end{array}$ | $1$ $6$ | 1 2 | 1 3 | 1 3 | 1 | 1 4 | 1 3 | 1 3 | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 65 |
| TOTAL |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & 12 \\ & 66 \end{aligned}$ |
| Average |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 63 , 3 |

## Posttest Control Group

| Stude | Content |  |  |  | Organiza tion |  |  |  | Vocabul ary |  |  |  | Languag e Use |  |  |  | Mechani <br> c |  |  |  | Tot al |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| nts <br> Name | $R$ $1$ | $\mathrm{R}$ $2$ | $\mathrm{R}$ $3$ | M | $R$ - 1 | $R$ - 2 | $\mathrm{R}$ $3$ | M | $R$ - 1 | $R$ - 2 | $\mathrm{R}$ $3$ | M | $R$ - 1 | $R$ <br> - | $\mathrm{R}$ $3$ | M | $R$ - 1 | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{R} \\ - \\ 2 \end{gathered}$ | $\mathrm{R}$ $3$ | M |  |
| ID | 3 | 3 | 2 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 95. |


|  | 0 | 0 | 9 | 0 | 8 | 9 | 9 | 9 | 8 | 9 | 9 | 9 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 |  |  |  |  | 333 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| N | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} 2 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} 2 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 91 |
| AN | $\begin{aligned} & 3 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $3$ | $\begin{aligned} & 3 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | $\begin{array}{r} \hline 96 . \\ 333 \\ 3 \end{array}$ |
| SHA | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 90 |
| VP | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $4$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $4$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $5$ | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 65 |
| HD | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $2$ | $2$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | $\begin{array}{r} 89 . \\ 333 \\ 3 \end{array}$ |
| RD | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 9 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 69 |
| TO | $\begin{aligned} & 3 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 3 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 3 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 3 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $2$ | $2$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | $\begin{array}{r} 98 \\ 333 \\ 3 \end{array}$ |
| TJ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | $\begin{array}{r} 53 . \\ 666 \\ 7 \end{array}$ |
| EJU | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | 9 | 9 | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $9$ $3$ | 9 | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 50 |
| SK | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | $\begin{array}{r} 85 . \\ 333 \\ 3 \end{array}$ |
| AM | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 6 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | 1 4 | 1 3 | 1 2 | 1 2 | 1 3 | 1 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 56 |
| FL | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 72 |


|  | 3 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 5 | 6 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| MT | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | 3 | 3 | 33 | 58 |
| BM | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 2 \\ 2 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 4 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | 3 | 3 | 33 | 70 |
| PL | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | 3 | 3 | 33 | 58 |
| SMR | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 2 \\ 1 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|l} \hline 1 \\ 4 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | 2 | 2 | 22 | 62 |
| ES | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 6 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $5$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | 3 | 3 | 33 | 64 |
| FWL | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $2$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | 4 | 4 | 44 | $\begin{array}{r} 85 . \\ 333 \\ 3 \end{array}$ |
| HH | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | 1 | $\begin{array}{\|l\|l} \hline 1 \\ 4 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | 3 | 3 | 33 | 74 |
| TOTAL |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & 148 \\ & 2, \\ & 667 \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | Average |  | $\begin{aligned} & 74 \\ & 13 \end{aligned}$ |

## Pretest Experimental Group

| stude | Content |  |  |  | Organiza tion |  |  |  | Vocabul ary |  |  |  | Languag e Use |  |  |  | Mechani <br> c |  |  |  | To tal |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| nts' <br> Name | $\mathrm{R}$ $1$ | $\mathrm{R}$ $2$ | $\mathrm{R}$ $3$ | M | $R$ - 1 | $\mathrm{R}$ $2$ | $\mathrm{R}$ $3$ | M | $\mathrm{R}$ $1$ | $R$ <br> - <br> 2 | $\mathrm{R}$ $3$ | M | $R$ - 1 | $\mathrm{R}$ $2$ | $\mathrm{R}$ $3$ | M | $R$ - 1 | $R$ - 2 | 3 | M |  |
| TRM | 2 3 | 2 | 2 | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | 1 | 1 | 1 | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 8 | 1 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 76 |


| TTM | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 46 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| SB | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | 1 <br> 5 | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 57 |
| NK | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 48 |
| IT | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 1 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 87 |
| R | $\begin{array}{\|l} 2 \\ 7 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 84 |
| IH | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 2 \\ 4 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 80 |
| MTA | $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline 2 \\ 8 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 93 |
| W | $2$ <br> 4 | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $5$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 78 |
| IPS | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 73 |
| AU | $\begin{array}{\|l} 1 \\ 9 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ $4$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 59 |
| H | $2$ $5$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 85 |
| DA | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | 1 <br> 1 | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $1$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 56 |
| TUP | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $2$ | $2$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 5 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 63 |
| MK | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 6 . \\ & 3 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 64. $33$ $3$ |
| NR | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 66 |


|  | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 7 | 6 |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| NP | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 |  |
|  | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 8 | 8 | 7 | 8 |  |  |  |  |  |

Posttest Experimental Group

| stude | Content |  |  |  | Organiza tion |  |  |  | Vocabul ary |  |  |  | Languag <br> e Use |  |  |  | Mechani <br> C |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| nts' <br> Name | R $1$ | $\mathrm{R}$ $2$ | R $3$ | M | R $1$ | $R$ - 2 | $\mathrm{R}$ $3$ | M | $R$ - 1 | R $2$ | R $3$ | M | $R$ - 1 | $\begin{gathered} \hline \mathrm{R} \\ - \\ 2 \end{gathered}$ | $\mathrm{R}$ $3$ | M | $\mathrm{R}$ $1$ | R $2$ | $\mathrm{R}$ $3$ | M | TO <br> TA L |
| TRM | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | 1 | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 94 |
| TTM | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & 9 \end{aligned}$ | 2 0 | 2 0 | 2 0 | 1 3 | 1 | 1 3 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 5 | 1 5 | 1 5 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 65 |


| SB | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 7 |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| NK | 8 | 8 | 7 | 8 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |

